SIR AUREL STEIN AND THE ‘LORDS OF THE MARCHES’
NEW ARCHIVAL MATERIALS

LUCA M. OLIVIERI
CONTENTS

List of illustrations 9
Foreword (M. Mancini/A.V. Rossi) 11
List of abbreviations 15
Editorial notes (M. De Chiara/L.M. Olivieri) 17

Introduction 23
Catalogue 31
Folder One 33
Folder Two 69
Folder Three 113
Commentary 171
Folder One 171
Folder Two 199
Folder Three 216

Appendices 239
1. Chronological chart of the archaeological sites (1872-1938) 241
2. Historical map of the archaeological sites (1872-1938) 251
3. Synoptic chart of the British Governors, Commissioners and ASI Officers in NWFP (1895-1939) 255
4. Alexander Caddy’s 1896 report: the Chakdara Ionic temple and other sites (K. Behrendt) 263
5. Catalogue of the Malakand Gandhara Collection (P. Brancaccio) 285
6. Catalogue of the Malakand Library 307
7. A. Stein correspondence in the Malakand Fund 313
Indexes (M. De Chiara) 317
Index of names 319
Index of places 327
Index of typology of documents 339

References 341

Additional photographic documentation 353
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Sir Aurel Stein and the Raja of Tangir and Darel, Shah Alam (Spring 1926) (p. 4)
Malakand Fort (p. 14)
Chakdara Fort (p. 14)

Text

Folder One: cover (p. 32)
Document 10 (p. 38)
Folder Two: cover (p. 70)
Document 138 (p. 84)
Document 176 (p. 99)
Document 181 (p. 102)
Folder Three: cover (p. 114)
Document 237 (pp. 124-125)
Document 245 (p. 128)
Document 281 (p. 141)
Document 286 (p. 143)
Document 297 (p. 146)
Document 302 (p. 149)
Document 312 (pp. 154-155)
Document 315 (pp. 158-159)
Document 330 (pp. 164-165)
The Badshah Saheb and the Chief Commissioner NWFP., Col. J.W. Keen (3 May 1926) (p. 238)
Historical map of the archaeological sites (1872-1938) (p. 253)
A.D.F. Dundas. The last British Governor of NWFP, Pakistan 1948-1949 (p. 260)
E.H. Cobb (p. 261)
Ionic Temple, Phase 1, 2 and 3 (p. 268)
Ionic Temple, façade and stairway (p. 269)
Ionic temple, Phases 1 (a-b) and 2 (p. 270)
Loriyan Tangai, main stupa (p. 272)
Loriyan Tangai, multi-piece false gable (p. 276)
Loriyan Tangai, multi-piece false gable (p. 277)
Malakand Collection, the statue no. 41 (p. 297)
Shahkot Pass (South) (p. 298)
Malakand Collection, three harmikas, a sundial (p. 301)

Additional photographic documentation

Document 113 (pp. 355-357)
Document 136 (p. 358)
Document 221 (pp. 359-360)
Document 222 (pp. 361-363)
Document 236 (pp. 364-365)
Document 238 (pp. 366-367)
Document 246 (pp. 368-369)
Document 253 (pp. 370-371)
Document 254 (pp. 372-374)
Document 260 (pp. 375-378)
Document 261 (pp. 379-380)
Document 263 (pp. 381-382)
Document 265 (pp. 383-386)
Document 266 (pp. 387-388)
Document 267 (pp. 389-390)
Document 269 (p. 391)
Document 270 (pp. 392-394)
Document 316 (p. 395)
Document 317 (pp. 396-397)
Document 320 (pp. 398-399)
Document 338 (p. 400)
Document 341 (p. 401)

The author at Malakand Fort (August 2008) (p. 402)
CATALOGUE
FOLDER ONE

The Folder consists of a tape binder; the title is: Political Agent Dir, Swat and Chitral’s Office. The Folder is catalogued as: 8, 9/ XX: Miscellaneous/ 1/ Archeology of the Swat Valley (For detailed index <see written>) Rules etc./ Vol.I [3253/600 (bottom left). The spelling variant, Archeology instead of Archaeology, is repeated.
It is composed of 354 written pages, numbered from 1 to 455 (1 to 168). The numbering is handwritten on the top right margin of all the written sheets to mark the pages (hereafter: p.); probably, the first numbering was initiated by Maj. H.A. Deane himself, and continued by his successors until 9 November 107 (p. 168, Document 72). With Maj. F.C. Minchen, from 18 December 1907 (Document 75) all the pages of the Folder were renumbered (only odd pages).
In all there are 110 Documents, including a 10bis and a 62bis. For the sake of convenience each has been given a progressive number from 1 to 108 (plus 10bis and 62bis), indicated at the beginning of each paragraph. The Folder was opened in 1895, and closed in 1911.

Documents

1) no page number, typewritten.
This is the index of the ante 1906 version of the Folder One; other materials were later included.
This is the version actually referred to by the page numbers handwritten in the margin of the index and the red ink numbering on odd sheets of the Folder. The red and blue pencil numbering is later and is common in most of the files examined, and therefore part of an operation of reorganization of the entire Political House archives.
The heading on the cover is repeated (MISCELLANEOUS – ARCHEOLOGY OF SWAT VALLEY) and displays the following index with handwritten notes in black ink (here displayed in italics):

1. Presentation of collection of Antiquities and Sculptures to Indian Museum Calcutta. p 2
2. Dr. Waddell’s Reports on Archaeological Research in Swat. p 6
4. Note on Udyana and Gandhara by Colonel Deane. p 21
5. Mons. Foucher’s visit to Swat. p 70
[6. Equal division of ‘finds’ between the Government of India and Foreign explorers. p 70
7. Rules regarding Acquisition by the Government under the Treasure Trove Act of Articles of Archaeological interest. p 73
8. Private excavators to be discouraged unless ‘certified’ archeologists p 77
9. Lists of Articles sent to Dr. Stein, and Lahore Museum etc., p 78
10. Measures taken to preserve the Buds[h]ist remains. p 94
11. Government of India Notification prohibiting import into British India from any part of Dir Swat and Chitral Agency of Buds[h]ist Sculptures, carvings, or inscriptions. p <<112>> [The space between the S and the c in Sculptures is bridged by a double liaison above and below]
12. Mr. Caddy’s Report on Swat Valley researches. p 119
13. Purchase of a set of photos of Sculptures. p 132

<Signature illegible>

August 31st 1906

2) p. 3 – number written top left (confusion between sheet and page) –, beginning of a manuscript letter, prot. n. 3827 (Foreign Department), dated Simla, 5th October 1895, from the Deputy Secretary to the Government of India to Major H.A. Deane, Political Officer for Dir and Swat, Malakand.

This is probably the first Document registered in the administrative unit denoted at the time as ‘Dir, Swat, Chitral, Bajaur and Malakand Agency’, since its first Political Agent, H.A. Deane, took up office on 1 October 1895. This is a letter containing a copy of part of the content of a letter of 31 August from the Government of Bengal in which the latter accepted to acquire a number of sculptures from the Swat valley collected by
Document 1
The signature in all likelihood is that of a subordinate of Major S.H. Godfrey who served as Political Agent from 1903 to 19 June 1907 (he replaced Major C. Archer, who held the post from 1899 to 1902) and later with the rank of Lieutenant Colonel from 23 September 1908 to 2 April 1909. Godfrey was therefore certainly the one responsible for a second reorganization of the Folder. Note that Deane is mentioned as ‘Colonel’.

Document 2
The first designation was that of ‘Political Officer with the Chitral Force, Malakand pass’. The designation of ‘Political Officer’ was used only for a very short time. As early as 1896 the definition of Political Agent is the official one (see fn. 2 in the Introduction). (Lieutenant-)Colonel Sir Harold Arthur Deane (KCSI) is the key figure in the history of Malakand and the NWFP. After being Chief Political Officer serving with the Chitral Relief Force, which occupied Malakand and then entered Dir and Chitral in support of the Robertson garrison (see below), he was Political Agent at Malakand for 5 years (after a short period as Political Agent in Kashmir). On 9 November 1901 he was appointed by Lord Curzon as the first Chief Commissioner of the newly established NWFP and will remain such until his death on 7 July 1908. The NWFP was therefore set up in 1901; the administrative division was suspended between 1955 and 1970 under the so-called ‘One Unit Scheme’; it was reinstated as NWFP until April 2010 when the province was renamed Khyber Pakthunkwa (K-P). On the formation of the NWFP, see SULTAN-I-ROME 2013.
Coming back to Deane, we deem it of interest to repeat here in full the portrait of him given by Olaf Caroe: ‘To know and respect, and be known and liked by, the leaders of the Yusufzai [the Pashtun of Swat, Malakand and Dir] society means that a man has entered into a sort of Pathan freemasonry, and reached a position in which the very quintessence of the Pathan spirit begins to be revealed to him. Deane was such a man. In appearance he was imposing. Tall and spare, with a commanding presence and searching dark-blue eyes, he made just the impression of resolution and assurance that Pathans look for in a man. He was fearless and he stood firm. He had, too, a sardonic sense of humour for which he was long remembered. […] It was because the tribes knew him to be utterly fearless, firm, honest and resolute that he became the true peace-maker. He never prated peace when there was no peace; he spoke and acted, and he was believed. The strain was great, and his health had been undermined. Deane collapsed in harness, and died just after reaching home in 1908’ (Caroe 1983: 421-22). In addition to Caroe’s we should like to recall the fresh and immediate impression A. Stein received of Deane at their first meeting: ‘Major Deane is the most pleasant of hosts and also an interesting historical type: the frontier politico who knows how to keep half-barbarian tribes under control’ (from the letter to his brother Ernst dated Malakand, Swat, 27 December 1897; in Mirsky 1977: 70-1). The last significant appreciation of Deane by Stein is to be found in Stein 1912a (6): ‘[Sir Harold Deane] who had always been my truest friend and patron […] is a] born ruler of men whose strength of mind and body impressed the most turbulent tribesmen’ (ibid.: 232). See also the brilliant description given in Foucher 1901. The fort at Malakand and the attached Political House were set up as the headquarters of the Political Officer and of the later Agency after the events linked to the siege of the Robertson garrison in Chitral. The Chitral action will include the occupation of Malakand, the establishment of a stable State in Dir and the definitive control of Chitral (and its territories towards Gilgit). In this chain of control, Swat remained a thorn in the side until at least 1917 (on these events see Olivier 2009; Sultan-i-Rome 2008).

As can be gleaned from a reading of Waddell’s reports, the Waddell expedition in July 1895, at the side of the Chitral Relief Force, seems to have been organized by the Calcutta Museum (that is by the Government
of Bengal) and the destination of the objects seems to have been decided before October the same year (Waddell will write in 1922 in the Encyclopaedia of Religions and Ethics that the sculpture objects collected were destined for the Museums of Calcutta and Peshawar: in 1895 the Museum of Peshawar still did not exist). One might be tempted to think there was a degree of competition between the two major institutions (Lahore and Calcutta) to increase their museum collections. Waddell’s mission was then illustrated by him in the Report on Archaeological Tour in Swat. Calcutta 1895; ‘Newly Excavated Greco-Buddhist Sculptures from Swat Valley’, Trans. of the Oriental Congress, 1896, sect. i, pp. 245-47; ‘Greco-Buddhist Sculptures in Swat’, Imperial and Asiatic Quarterly Revue, 1897, 3, I, pp. 192-94; ‘Swat or Udyana’, in J. Hastings with J.A. Selbie and L. H. Gray, eds., Encyclopaedia of Religions and Ethics, vol. XII, New York 1922 (on Waddell see the fundamental Errington 1990).

Waddell was a functionary of the Indian Medical Service whose personal passion led him to be involved in government archaeology. In 1892 he had distinguished himself for an extraordinarily effective interpretation of the ruins of a site on the banks of the Ganges (Patna) which he recognized as the ancient Pataliputra. Waddell, following the itineraries of the Chinese pilgrims, correctly identified the stupa of Asoka, the walls described by Megasthenes, the palace area, etc. While the chance finding of a late inscription mentioning ‘Padali-pura’ immediately confirmed the identification of the ancient capital, the excavations Waddell himself suggested, which were carried out in 1894 and 1895 (by the Government of Bengal, Public Works Department; see L.A. Waddell, Report on the Excavations at Pataliputra. Calcutta 1903), confirmed his topographic interpretation (Chakrabarti 1988: 114-15). Waddell perhaps did not take part in the 1895 excavations as he was involved in his special mission in Malakand on behalf of the Government of Bengal.

Document 4

Kafir-kot A is meant to refer to this site noted only by Waddell; the other Kafir-kot, near Nal, is referred to as Kafir-kot B (see Errington 1990: 779). It should be borne in mind that the Mohra Pass was not and never became part of British possessions.

Wuch (Ucch) is N of Chakdara in the Jandul Valley. Ramora is located on the left side of the Jandul Valley, opposite Chakdara.
This is a report updating Keen as to the state of the matter: the Wali has no objections, even to allowing Stein to visit the area of Kalam (it should be noted that this name is underlined by Stein in Document 239 to indicate its importance). Metcalfe points out however that it would be wise to downplay this part of the itinerary: ‘I think we should be well-advised to discourage him. As you know our policy toward this tract is one of exclusion of the three neighbours who would like to get in there viz. Chitral, Dir and Mian Gul’. It is obvious that in this sense Metcalfe cannot ask the Wali to organize the visit as this would mean a implicit recognition of territorial claims; the possibility of involving the Kalam ‘Jirga’ is ruled out as it had recently been hostile to the Wali. On the other hand, Stein could consider himself lucky to stop at Durushkhela, as he would be the first European to visit the area N of Mingora after Colonel Godfrey (for whom see Comments to Documents 10 and 17). One last point before leaving this Document: according to the Wazir, Metcalfe claims, there were no Buddhist ruins N of Manglawar, a fact, as will be seen, that was only partially true.

The letter goes on to touch upon the issue of funding Stein: Metcalfe has no funds at his disposal and, among other things, for contingent expenditure related to the coming and going of various Political Agents, he has hand to make an extraordinary allocation of Rs 5,000: ‘However I will try to make a few hundreds available and I do not think that the expenses should be heavy, as the Main Gul is not grasping’. Metcalfe adds that he will reply to Stein (whom he hopes to meet personally in Delhi), telling him that he is in touch with both the Wali and Keen, without however informing him in advance that there are no apparent difficulties regarding his visit. In conclusion, he announces that he will return the file to Rae after making copies of several parts, namely Documents 221-238.
Museum of Central Asian Antiquities,
Raisina, Delhi: January 27, 1926.

Dear Mr. Metcalfe,

The very encouraging interest which Colonel Keen has shown in my proposed tour in Swat and the Miangul's territory adjoining towards the Indus, together with the advice he very kindly gave me in the course of a long talk during his recent visit to Delhi, induce me to trouble you direct with regard to certain details of my plan. From correspondence which had passed since last summer between the Chief Commissioner and Colonel James (an old and ever helpful friend) you may have seen how old and promising is the plan of mine and of how anxious I am to make fullest possible use of the chance which the Miangul's friendly attitude now holds out for realizing that project.

It has attracted me greatly ever since in 1877-8 I was able to see Lower Swat and then Buner with the help of Colonel Deane and General Blood.

Later communications from Colonel Keen may have told you also how, quite apart from the search for the tombs of Alexander's campaign, I must attach great importance to being enabled this summer as possible of Swat and its side valleys. The whole of this ground possesses considerable historical and antiquarian interest, and for this reason and
also because it is a but imperfectly known area, I very eager to do what is possible for the study of its geography. My tour to Mahaban in 1909, and through Sahel and Tangier in 1913, both tracts not previously visited by a European, have shown how essential it is to combine topographical with historical work. They also proved that given reasonable care and some fact this combination is not likely to cause difficulties on the frontier either, or my leading Asian expeditions, of course, I tried always to serve both geography and archaeology.

The enclosed copy of an extract from what I wrote yesterday to Colonel Keen as to a provisional programme for the tour will show you the approximate dates and routes contemplated. They might, of course, have to be modified if local considerations render this advisable. But I thought perhaps, especially to explain that the year of a later season would be likely to interfere far more with effective work than such little discomfort as cold and some snow on higher ground might cause.

I shall feel most grateful for any advice you could kindly give me. It would be of very great help if I could be provided with an intelligent man thoroughly familiar with the ground and capable of securing information as to ruins, etc. I should, of course, be glad to offer adequate remuneration. The two assistants I propose to take with me are both熟悉 with the ground beyond. It would be specially useful familiar with the ground beyond. It would be specially useful if a list of places with old remains could be secured direct from the Maharet. Part of this too, you alone can judge. Please forgive me troubling you with so long a letter and kindly accept the few little papers sent herewith as bearing on the part of the Marches you are guarding.

Yours sincerely, F. Steen.
When Alexander Caddy visited Gandhara and Swat under the direction of the Secretary of the Government of Bengal, his express purpose was to collect Gandharan sculpture for the Indian Museum in Calcutta and to photographically document the region. While this trip is well known from both the archived photos and the extensive sculptural remains from Loriyan Tangai that he took back to Calcutta, the actual report of Caddy’s activities had been lost. Fortunately, a copy of this report, which appears to have been submitted to the Secretary of the Government of Bengal by Caddy in 1896, has recently come to light in the Malakand Fund (Document 42). Although typeset, this report appears to have been intended only for internal circulation and was never published officially; the surviving copy exists only as the printed text with empty spaces for the various referenced maps, plans, sketches, and photographs, which were originally affixed to this copy of the report. It has been possible to reconstruct most of the photographic record from a numbered set of Caddy’s prints now in the

---

1 Dated Camp Chakdara, the 13th May, Mânsahera, the 18th July 1896. From-Alexander E. Caddy, Esq., on special duty, To-The Chief Secretary to the Government of Bengal. For the geographical references of all the sites mentioned in this paper, see Appendix 1 and 2 (the Map). This Report is not elsewhere recorded and, so far, it is the only copy available or survived. We hope in a future plan to prepare a critical edition of that Report, complete with the photographic documentation from the British Library.
All the pieces included in this descriptive Catalogue are presently located outside the two uppermost buildings of the Political Agent's compound: the Guesthouse and the Residence. Most of the sculptures are in the front gardens of the Guesthouse and of the Residence. Only a few pieces are placed elsewhere in the garden. It is worth remembering that these objects don’t represent the original collection, which had a long history of displacement; lastly, in the 90s, 134 pieces were donated by the Malakand administration to the Swat Archaeological Museum in Saidu Sharif, where they were registered under the label MK. Some of them are currently on display (Galleries 5 and 6).

The sculptures nos. 1-40, and 52 are all displayed in the Guesthouse’s garden, on the N enclosure wall; no. 41 along the steps leading to the Residence’s garden from the N side; no. 42 is in the centre of the Residence’s garden; nos. 43-51 are in the Residence’s garden, E enclosure wall.

Most of the pieces show traces of recent damage, with the exception of no. 41 which is more or less in the original condition; most part of nos. 6, 40 and 52 are missing; no. 42 is a modern assemblage (1937) of different pieces in the shape of a turreted structure for a sundial. The structure has been successively painted in white (lime).

All the pieces are made of gray/grayish schist unless differently indicated; measurements have not always been taken given the awkward pos-

---

1 This Catalogue is only meant to present a descriptive record of the antiquities preserved in these premises. The photographic documentation, including the few photos illustrating these pages, was handed over the PA in Spring 2009.
CATALOGUE OF THE MALAKAND LIBRARY

1) 49; - ; - ; No. 63 (17/3/06); Colonel Sir W.S.A. Lockhart (KCB, Bengal Army) and Colonel R.G. Woodthorpe (CB, Royal Engineers), *The Gilgit Mission 1885-86* (4to); Eyre and Spottiswoode, London 1889; Stamp: “Strictly Confidential Secret”; (at page two, there is an autograph (blue ink) by H. Deane: “The Chitral Mission The Gilgit Mission 1889” followed by his signature).

2) 35; - ; - ; No. 67 (17/3/06); *Russian Army List (containing composition and stations of the Russian Army)* compiled by Captain A.B. Lindsay, (In the Intelligence Branch of the Quarter Master General Department, Simla.); 2nd Edition may 1904; Simla Printed at the Government Central Printing Office 1904; Confidential (with unreadable stamped and handwritten annotations).

---

1 The present list includes only printed materials pertaining to the pre-Partition era. The majority of the 49 volumes are in 8vo and hardback if not differently indicated in the list. The first book was personally inventoried by Maj. Deane in 1889 (1); the last entry before the Partition is dated July 1945 (49).

2 These numbers refer to different cataloguing phases (from post-1945 to 2006), which internal chronology is not established. N.B.: punctuation, capitalization, spaces, etc., reproduce the original.

3 Secret use is always explained by the following Note (cover, top): “This publication is property of the Government of India, and it is intended for personal information of the individual to whom issued and of those officers under him whose duties it effects. He is personally responsible for its safe custody and that its contents are disclosed to those officers and to them only. Note. This document will appear on A. F. A.-24, (Annual Return of Secret Documents)”. Secret reports have a Serial number.

4 Confidential use is often explained by the following Note (cover, top): “This book is property of the Government of India. And it is intended for personal information of the individual
Dear Colonel Kennion,

Allow me to ask your kind help with regard to the case of systematic smuggling of Graeco-Buddhist sculptures from across theZen border to which the enclosed file of my Office refers. I am very sorry, indeed, for not having written to you about it earlier, but the last two months have been a time of quite exceptional strain for me, as apart from the urgent and heavy labours on the detailed report of my previous Central-Asian explorations I have had to push on preparations for a new journey in Chinese Turkestan which has recently received final sanction.

My Native Assistant when on tour in the Katlang tract in February last, obtained what he considers quite reliable information about a well-known trader in antiques, Muhammad Ilyas, of Khusanai, having a stock of sculptures ready for export via Kashkali. He promptly informed the Police by telegraph as the enclosed file shows. But the Police were slow in taking any action and ultimately let off Muhammad Ilyas (as you will see from the record on p. 3) on a promise that he will not tamper with any sculptures within British Territory.

The remark of the A.S.P., Haran, will show, that he apparently considers the importation of sculptures from across the border as permissible, whereas the insertion of a special section (17) in the Ancient Monuments Preservation Act of 1962
shows clearly that suppression of this nefarious traffic is distinctly aimed at. It is well-known that the section was particularly inserted in order to stop the wanton destruction of sculptures which had been carried on for so many years in the trans-border tracks north of Peshawar to the irreparable loss of research, and which is deplored in its results by all competent persons.

I know that you and your predecessors have endeavoured to suppress this mischievous exploitation, and the case of Nazim Shah which we heard an account of, when together last year near Wazair, was an instance of the good which might be effected by strict action.

But there is no question that the traffic is directly encouraged by the unscrupulous way in which certain European collectors continue to hunt for such sculptures, in spite of the official prohibition; also that within the administrative border the action of some who ought to know better, is often far too lenient, consideration being shown for what is thought a mere harmless hobby.

The only way in which this secret digging for 'Bute' and the traffic in them, can be effectively stopped is strict watching and punishment of the agents who carry on these operations across the border. There is no question whatever about their chief, if not sole hunting ground being the Swat Valley, and fortunately the Walskeand Agency has shown before that it can deal effectively with offenders when caught, -- whoever may have prompted them directly or indirectly.
So I hope, you will kindly do what is possible to have the reported chief offenders, Muhammad Ilyas and Naseemof Khi Lariman, carefully watched on their next visit across the border and if possible, brought to book. It might be worth while to offer a reward for such a 'catch'. There are other pensioners from that part likely to lend a hand in these diggings and dealings; but their case is not so notorious as the above. Prompt and sharp administrative action, such as fortunately is possible in your Agency would have a most salutary effect and gradually stop this underground drain of what antiquities are still left in old Khyber.

I greatly regret that old and new tasks have combined to prevent me from benefitting, as I had wished, by your kind offer of help for work in the Swat Valley. My big Scientific Report on my former journey deals comprehensively with the early history of Swat and Chitral, and as it gets into print I should be happy to let you see proofs of these chapters in case you should care to have a look at them.

Kindly return the file to my Peshawar office, when no longer needed, as I am giving over charge a few days hence.

With best regards,
yours sincerely,

A. Stein